

October 2005

1.7

Response

Benchmarks

1.7 In responses to literature, students show understanding of reading, connect what has been read to the broader world of ideas, concepts, and issues, and make judgments about the text. This is evident when students:

PreK-4:

- A. Connect plot/ideas/concepts to experience, including other literature;
- B. Go beyond retelling of plot by reflecting on what is read and making connections to broader ideas, concepts, and issues;
- C. Support judgments about what has been read by drawing from experience, other literature, and evidence from the text, including direct quotations.

5-8: Evidence PreK-4 applies, plus -

- D. Clearly articulate a point of view, or state a firm judgment about the piece discussed;
- E. Engage the reader effectively and provide closure;
- F. Maintain a sense of audience by addressing the reader's possible questions.

9-12: Evidence PreK – 8 applies, plus –

- G. Establish interpretive claims and support them.

Grade 4 Benchmarks

The Amazing Days of Abby Hayes	4
Farmer Boy	3
Horton Gives a Hoot	3
The True story of the Three Little Pigs	3
Lifesaver	2
Literary Response	1

Standard 1.7 Response to Text *Revised Rubric*

Grade 4

1.7 In responses to literature, students show understanding of reading, connect what has been read to the broader world of ideas, concepts, and issues, and make judgments about the text.

Dimensions of Writing Standard 1.5 Criteria	<u>Score Point 4</u> Shows evidence of exceeding the standard	<u>Score Point 3</u> Shows evidence of meeting the standard	<u>Score Point 2</u> Shows evidence of being below the standard	<u>Score Point 1</u> Basic and limited writing
Purpose <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Context Focus/controlling idea Evidence of understanding and reflection/ connection that are related to text Analysis of the elements of the text (character, character change, author's craft, theme, compare/contrast) 	<p>Clear context includes name of author and title of book and may include a hook</p> <p>Focus/controlling idea is clear</p> <p>Responds directly to the text with analysis and includes a relevant connection to broader ideas (text to text/text to self/text to world).</p>	<p>Clear context includes name of author and title of book.</p> <p>Focus/controlling idea is clear</p> <p>Responds directly to the text with analysis and includes a relevant connection to broader ideas (text to text/text to self/text to world).</p>	<p>Little context.</p> <p>Topic and/or focus may shift. Writing may rely on personal response</p>	<p>No context.</p> <p>May not have a focus/controlling idea and may be limited to a general summary or retelling</p>
Organization <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Overall coherence Information presented in a logical, cohesive fashion. 	<p>Has clear, consistent coherence and organization</p> <p>Has introduction, body, conclusion</p> <p>Uses transitions</p>	<p>Organization is clear and consistent</p> <p>Has introduction, body, conclusion</p> <p>Uses some transitions</p>	<p>May have some organizational structure</p>	<p>Little or no organization is present</p>
Details/Elaboration <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Specific concrete details with appropriate references to/citations from text to support writer's point of view. 	<p>May include citations as well as references to the text to support focus</p> <p>In depth, precise elaboration related to focus</p>	<p>Uses references to text and concrete details to support focus. May use citations</p> <p>Ideas are elaborated appropriate to grade level</p>	<p>Random details and no or unclear references to text</p> <p>Ideas are not elaborated or details are insufficient to support focus</p>	
Voice and Tone <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Vocabulary Sentence structure Sentence variety 	<p>Uses effective vocabulary, sentence variety and/or structure</p>	<p>Uses appropriate vocabulary, sentence variety and/or structure</p>	<p>Uses confusing language, sentence structure, and variety</p> <p>Uses pale vocabulary and basic sentence structure</p>	

**The Amazing Days of Abby Hayes
Reach for the Stars**

How would you like to have to memorize every part of the play, *Peter Pan*, and learn **all** of the songs and dance routines in **only two weeks**? Well, that's what Abby Hayes does in the book The Amazing Days of Abby Hayes, Reach for the Stars by Anne Mazer. Abby's fifth grade class is performing the play, *Peter Pan*. Tryouts are in two weeks and Abby wants to try out for the part of Wendy. Unfortunately, Brianna, the best actress in the class and one of the class snobs, wants to try out for the same part. Abby proves to be very determined to get the role she wants. Abby is also a very creative girl and uses her creativity in different ways throughout the book.

Abby is very determined to get a starring role in *Peter Pan*. She wants to play Wendy. When discussing her part in the play, Abby told Ms. Kantor, her teacher, "I know the play inside and out. I've rehearsed it, read it, sung it, danced it, watched it, and dreamed of it." Throughout the book, Abby is constantly focused on doing well on her tryout to get the part of Wendy. As I was reading the story, I was convinced that Abby would succeed. Abby also shows her determination by being a good student in school. She even gave up recess to work on her geography project. Jessica, Abby's best friend said, "You're sure you don't want to come with us?" Abby replied, "I'm staying in, I have to finish this." During recess that day, Abby was able to finish her geography project. In the book it says, "Why had it taken her so long, and why had she thought the assignment was so hard? It had been fun to do. All she had needed was a good idea. I'm sure Abby was glad that she completed her geography project so she could have more time to practice for the play.

Abby is also creative. She uses her creativity to make a map called "Grandma Emma's Island" for a school assignment. She drew the map as a gift for her Grandma Emma who was coming to watch her perform in the play. On page 70 it says, "Abby picked up a green pencil and drew the outlines of a large island that almost filled the page. Abby drew a lake, a mountain range, and a city where her grandmother would live. The city had plenty of parks for Zipper, her grandma's dog, to run in. She drew roads from

the city to the mountain ranges and lakes and seashore." I thought Abby used a lot of imagination and created a **very** nice map. If "Grandma Emma's Island" was a real place, I would like to go there! Another way in which Abby was creative was when she was looking over the script of the play. She thought it was boring. Abby decided to be creative and make up new lines as she was going along. During her tryout, Abby's teachers noticed the changes. On page 99, Ms. Kantor told Abby, We noticed during the audition that you made changes to Wendy's lines as you were reading. We like the changes." I think Abby thought she was going to get in trouble for changing some of the lines! She must have been glad to learn that her teachers liked how she had changed the script.

As you can see, Abby Hayes is a determined and very smart girl in the book The Amazing Days of Abby Hayes, Reach for the Stars by Anne Mazer. Abby has two sisters, Isabel and Eva. Abby calls them her "SuperSisters" because Eva is a super athlete and Isabelle is a super smart student. Abby always tries to do as well as her sisters. When Abby asked her parents if she could take singing lessons in preparation for the play, unfortunately they said, "No". Isabel offered to give Abby singing lessons because she studied voice with an opera singer when she was in sixth and seventh grade. Abby wasn't very happy about that. There are more challenges that Abby has before her tryout and even after her tryout is over. I really enjoyed reading this book. It is a real page-turner. I especially liked that Abby kept a journal about her thoughts and she shares many of her journal entries in the story. If you want to find out how the story ends, read The Amazing Days of Abby Hayes, Reach for the Stars. You'll be glad you did.

Grade 4 Response to Text
Character Analysis
Effectiveness Score = 4

The Amazing Days of Abby Hayes
Reach for the Stars

How would you like to have to memorize every part of the play, *Peter Pan*, and learn **all** of the songs and dance routines in **only two weeks**? Well, that's what Abby Hayes does in the book The Amazing Days of Abby Hayes, Reach for the Stars by Anne Mazer. Abby's fifth grade class is performing the play, *Peter Pan*. Tryouts are in two weeks and Abby wants to try out for the part of Wendy. Unfortunately, Brianna, the best actress in the class and one of the class snobs, wants to try out for the same part. Abby proves to be very determined to get the role she wants. Abby is also a very creative girl and uses her creativity in different ways throughout the book.

"Hook" engages the reader and supplies succinct context

Clear focus

Abby is very determined to get a starring role in *Peter Pan*. She wants to play Wendy. When discussing her part in the play, Abby told Ms. Kantor, her teacher, "I know the play inside and out. I've rehearsed it, read it, sung it, danced it, watched it, and dreamed of it." Throughout the book, Abby is constantly focused on doing well on her tryout to get the part of Wendy. As I was reading the story, I was convinced that Abby would succeed. Abby also shows her determination by being a good student in school. She even gave up recess to work on her geography project. Jessica, Abby's best friend said, "You're sure you don't want to come with us?" Abby replied, I'm staying in, I have to finish this. During recess that day, Abby was able to finish her geography project. In the book it says, "Why had it taken her so long, and why had she thought the assignment was so hard? It had been fun to do. All she had needed was a good idea. I'm sure Abby was glad that she completed her geography project so she could have more time to practice for the play.

Topic sentence refers to focus

In-depth, precise elaboration and direct citations support focus

Writer connects to text with a personal connection that is related to the text and is evaluative

Refers to focus

Abby is also creative. She uses her creativity to make a map called "Grandma Emma's Island" for a school assignment. She drew the map as a gift for her Grandma Emma who was coming to watch her perform in the play. On page 70 it says, "Abby picked up a green pencil and drew the outlines of a large

Two examples of in-depth, precise elaboration and direct citations that support focus

island that almost filled the page. Abby drew a lake, a mountain range, and a city where her grandmother would live. The city had plenty of parks for Zipper, her grandma's dog, to run in. She drew roads from the city to the mountain ranges and lakes and seashore. *I thought Abby used a lot of imagination and created a very nice map. If "Grandma Emma's Island" was a real place, I would like to go there!* Another way in which Abby was creative was when she was looking over the script of the play. She thought it was boring. Abby decided to be creative and make up new lines as she was going along. During her tryout, Abby's teachers noticed the changes. On page 99, Ms. Kantor told Abby, We noticed during the audition that you made changes to Wendy's lines as you were reading. We like the changes." I think Abby thought she was going to get in trouble for changing some of the lines! She must have been glad to learn that her teachers liked how she had changed the script.

Personal connection is related to focus and evaluative (in italics)

Personal response to citation is related to text and is evaluative

As you can see, Abby Hayes is a determined and very smart girl in the book *The Amazing Days of Abby Hayes, Reach for the Stars* by Anne Mazer. Abby has two sisters, Isabel and Eva. Abby calls them her "SuperSisters" because Eva is a super athlete and Isabelle is a super smart student. Abby always tries to do as well as her sisters. When Abby asked her parents if she could take singing lessons in preparation for the play, unfortunately they said, "No". Isabel offered to give Abby singing lessons because she studied voice with an opera singer when she was in sixth and seventh grade. Abby wasn't very happy about that. There are more challenges that Abby has before her tryout and even after her tryout is over.

Repetition of focus

Unnecessary context is a slight digression

Conclusion starts here

Personal connection not necessary and not related to focus.

I really enjoyed reading this book. It is a real page-turner. I especially liked that Abby kept a journal about her thoughts and she shares many of her journal entries in the story. If you want to find out how the story ends, read The Amazing Days of Abby Hayes, Reach for the Stars. You'll be glad you did.

Effectiveness Score = 4

In this response to literature, the writer uses effective vocabulary and sentence structure to establish clear context and a strong controlling idea. The organization is tightly controlled through the body paragraphs: a topic sentence followed by specific reference to text, an appropriate citation, and writer reflection. A slight digression in the last paragraph is still related back to the main idea of the piece. Overall, this piece exceeds the expectations for fourth grade writing.

Farmer Boy

The book *Farmer Boy* was written by Laura Ingalls Wilder. The main characters in the book are Almonzo, Eliza Jane, Alice, Royal, and Mr. Coorse. This story takes place a very long time ago in the year 1866.

Almonzo, Eliza Jane, Alice, and Royal all went to school together. Mr. Coorse was their teacher. That is very similar to what we do now. They all got recess as well as homework, just like we do now. They had lessons in school to learn and lunch to eat, just like we do now. There are plenty of things that we still do now just like they did many years ago, although many things have changed.

All of the children were not the same ages yet they were all in the same class. That is very different from what we do today. Their teacher, Mr. Coorse, was sometimes very mean. He would whip the children. The teacher would stay with each child's family for several weeks. This too is very different from what we do today. The children were given baths at school in a wooden tub. They also had to bring a dinner plate to school. That is something that we do not do today.

I would prefer to go to school in 2002 for many reasons. I think that it is great that the teacher respects the children, has her own house, and that we don't get whipped. I am also glad that we don't have to take baths and eat dinner at school. I like having my privacy and being with my family for dinner.

**Grade 4 Response to Literature
Comparison & Contrast
Effectiveness Score = 3**

Farmer Boy

The book Farmer Boy was written by Laura Ingalls Wilder. The main characters in the book are Almonzo, Eliza Jane, Alice, Royal, and Mr. Coorse. This story takes place a very long time ago in the year 1866.

**Writer supplies
necessary context**

Almonzo, Eliza Jane, Alice, and Royal all went to school together. Mr. Coorse was their teacher. That is very similar to what we do now. They all got recess as well as homework, just like we do now. They had lessons in school to learn and lunch to eat, just like we do now. There are plenty of things that we still do now just like they did many years ago, although many things have changed.

**Comparison
details – Part one**

**Part two of focus -
-Contrast**

All of the children were not the same ages yet they were all in the same class. That is very different from what we do today. Their teacher, Mr. Coorse, was sometimes very mean. He would whip the children. The teacher would stay with each child's family for several weeks. This too is very different from what we do today. The children were given baths at school in a wooden tub. They also had to bring a dinner plate to school. That is something that we do not do today.

**Contrast details
are specific**

I would prefer to go to school in 2002 for many reasons. I think that it is great that the teacher respects the children, has her own house, and that we don't get whipped. I am also glad that we don't have to take baths and eat dinner at school. I like having my privacy and being with my family for dinner.

**Personal
response in
conclusion is
appropriate to
focus**

Effectiveness Score = 3

In this response, the writer demonstrates a clear understanding of the text; in fact, by choosing compare/contrast as the focus, s/he is using a high level of critical thinking for fourth grade. A Venn diagram might have been used for a graphic organizer. Details lack elaboration but are plentiful and specific enough to support the focus. The organization is consistent. In the conclusion the writer makes a judgment, which serves well as personal response.

Horton Gives a Hoot

In Horton Hears a Who! there is an elephant named Horton who notices a small speck of dust while he is bathing. Horton thinks that there might be people on the speck of dust because he thought that he heard a voice of a little person. Then the Kangaroos came along and asked Horton who he was talking to and Horton said it was the Whos. The Kangaroos thought that Horton was crazy! In the story, Horton is caring and a believer.

We can see that Horton is caring when he saves the Whos from when the Kangaroos splashed water on them. He thought that the water would drown them. He carries them out of the way. We can also see Horton is caring when the animals who took the Whos and gave them to the black bird to take them away. When the black bird took off with the Whos in his beak, Horton was right behind the bird crying out "Please don't harm all my little folks, who have as much of a right to live as us bigger folks."! Over the mountains and hills that battered his bones and hurt his toenails. Horton followed the bird. The black bird dropped the Whos into a huge spot where there were millions of clovers. Horton looked through all the clovers until he found them.

We can see that Horton is a believer when he keeps on insisting that there are Whos on the speck of dust. We can also see this when he didn't care what the other animals thought. He still believed in the Whos. Horton said: " A person is a person no matter how small." He meant that they mattered too.

In conclusion, Horton is caring and a believer. He would make a good friend.

**Grade 4 Response to Text
Character Analysis
Effectiveness Score = 3**

Horton Gives a Hoot

In Horton Hears a Who! there is an elephant named Horton who notices a small speck of dust while he is bathing. Horton thinks that there might be people on the speck of dust because he thought that he heard a voice of a little person. Then the Kangaroos came along and asked Horton who he was talking to and Horton said it was the Whos. The Kangaroos thought that Horton was crazy! In the story, Horton is caring and a believer.

Context addresses readers' need

Two-pronged focus

We can see that Horton is caring when he saves the Whos from when the Kangaroos splashed water on them. He thought that the water would drown them. He carries them out of the way. We can also see Horton is caring when the animals who took the Whos and gave them to the black bird to take them away. When the black bird took off with the Whos in his beak, Horton was right behind the bird crying out "Please don't harm all my little folks, who have as much of a right to live as us bigger folks." Over the mountains and hills that battered his bones and hurt his toenails. Horton followed the bird. The black bird dropped the Whos into a huge spot where there were millions of clovers. Horton looked through all the clovers until he found them.

Refers to focus

Refers to focus

Well-elaborated support for focus includes specific references to text, effective language, citation and interpretation

We can see that Horton is a believer when he keeps on insisting that there are Whos on the speck of dust. We can also see this when he didn't care what the other animals thought. He still believed in the Whos. Horton said: "A person is a person no matter how small." He meant that they mattered too.

Interpretation of citation

In conclusion, Horton is caring and a believer. He would make a good friend.

Aha! Reflective personal response is evaluative and appropriate to focus

Effectiveness Score = 3

In this response to literature this fourth grade writer demonstrates clear understanding of the text by choosing to focus on character analysis. The support for the focus is well-elaborated with specific references to text and citations which have reflection. The writer has a reflective "Aha!" statement in the conclusion.

The True Story Of the Three Little Pigs

We read the book The True Story Of Three Little Pigs. By Jon Scieszka and illustrated by Lane Smith. This story was about the story of the three little pigs and told by the wolf. The wolf is trying to tell us he didn't do it. He said he just needed a cup of sugar for his grandmother cake. The wolf says it wasn't his fault. This book is funny because of the words and pictures.

One reason it is funny is because of the words. I thought it was funny when the wolf said, "It seemed like a shame to leave a perfectly good ham dinner lying there in the straw. So I ate it up. Think of it as a big cheeseburger just lying there." I think it would be funny to see a wolf eating a ham dinner. The words are also funny when the third little pig yells, "your old granny can sit on a pin." I think it is funny that the third little pig is yelling at the wolf and insulting him.

Another reason this book is funny is because of the pictures. One of the pictures that is funny is when Alexander T. Wolf was in jail. He was holding a cup that said Pig Penn. I think it is funny because he is in jail and still wants a cup of sugar. Another picture I think is funny is when the cops drove to the third little pigs house. The one pig is dressed as a cop another pig is dressed as a news reporter. I think pigs are funny when they are dressed as cops and news reporters.

In conclusion, I think the pictures and words are funny. I laughed at the pictures of the wolf. I think the wolf is guilty. I think he really wanted to eat the pigs. You should read this book and you would like it.

The True Story Of the Three Little Pigs

We read the book The True Story Of Three Little Pigs. By Jon Scieszka and illustrated by Lane Smith. This story was about the story of the three little pigs and told by the wolf. The wolf is trying to tell us he didn't do it. He said he just needed a cup of sugar for his grandmother cake. The wolf says it wasn't his fault. This book is funny because of the words and pictures.

Point of view/narrator is key to understanding the

Analytical focus

One reason it is funny is because of the words. I thought it was funny when the wolf said, "It seemed like a shame to leave a perfectly good ham dinner lying there in the straw. So I ate it up. Think of it as a big cheeseburger just lying there." I think it would be funny to see a wolf eating a ham dinner. The words are also funny when the third little pig yells, "your old granny can sit on a pin." I think it is funny that the third little pig is yelling at the wolf and insulting him.

Citations followed by commentary

Personal response is evaluative and appropriate to the focus

Transitions are repetitious but effective

Another reason this book is funny is because of the pictures. One of the pictures that is funny is when Alexander T. Wolf was in jail. He was holding a cup that said Pig Penn. I think it is funny because he is in jail and still wants a cup of sugar. Another picture I think is funny is when the cops drove to the third little pigs house. The one pig is dressed as a cop another pig is dressed as a news reporter. I think pigs are funny when they are dressed as cops and news reporters.

Numerous references to text

Personal response is evaluative and appropriate to the focus

I think the pictures and words are funny. I laughed at the pictures of the wolf. I think the wolf is guilty. I think he really wanted to eat the pigs. You should read this book and you would like it.

Effectiveness Score = 3

The focus of this response to literature is author's craft; it analyzes what makes the book funny. The writer's ability to address his concept shows a clear understanding of the text. Like "Farmer Boy," the details are listed without a lot of elaboration; however, the quantity of examples supports the focus well. The language and sentence structure are appropriate for fourth grade.

Lifesaver

In the book, Horton hears a Who, Horton an elephante gets out of the water and finds the voice. He brings the Who, who is a voice, to a safe place and protects him and his people. In this story, Horton is caring and thoughtful.

He's caring because he looks out for Whos. He guards them from the kangaroo. He also protects them from the monkeys who want to boil them in oil.

He is thoughtful when he follows the black-bottomed bird. He aches and groans going over the mountain, but he still follows and saves them by searching through all of the clovers until he finds them.

I think Horton would make a very good friend because he is caring and thoughtful.

***Grade 4 Response to Text
Character Analysis
Effectiveness Score = 2***

Lifesaver

In the book, Horton hears a Who, Horton an elephante gets out of the water and finds the voice. He brings the Who, who is a voice, to a safe place and protects him and his people. In this story, Horton is caring and thoughtful.

Clear focus; context needed

He's caring because he looks out for Whos. He guards them from the kangaroo. He also protects them from the monkeys who want to boil them in oil.

He is thoughtful when he follows the black-bottomed bird. He aches and groans going over the mountain, but he still follows and saves them by searching through all of the clovers until he finds them.

*Each example
needs much more
elaboration*

I think Horton would make a very good friend because he is caring and thoughtful.

*Personal response
is appropriate to
focus*

Effectiveness Score = 2

This response to literature has a focus and is clearly organized, but it lacks elaboration. The details are insufficient to support the focus. There is merely an attempt at a personal response. With more elaboration, the piece could meet the standard for fourth grade.

Literary Response

In the book The Indian in the Cupboard by Lynne Reid Banks.

This book is about an indian named Little Bear and a boy named Omri who go through the cupboard many times a day like to bring Boone the cowboy to life and Tommy the doctor soidler.

Instead of a tepee an Iroquois indian lives in a longhouse Little bear says "I live in no tepee. I live longhouse! "Not want toy" said the indian, and turned his back, folding his arms across his chest with an air of finality.

The Iroquois indians love to eat meat Little Bear tells Omri "No good sorry! Little Bear hungry, work all day, cook meat, now what I eat! I chop you down like a tree!" "You no Great Spirit! Only stupid boy! Fight, spoil good meal! You feel shame!"

The Indian in the Cupboard showed me never to bring a toy to life because Little Bear has to have meat witch shows me that if I brought a toy to life I would have to spare alot of meat. Also I would have to make sure that I had a longhouse not a teepee so my Indian wouldn't yell at me.

Literary Response

In the book The Indian in the Cupboard by Lynne Reid Banks.

This book is about an indian named Little Bear and a boy named Omri who go through the cupboard many times a day like to bring Boone the cowboy to life and Tommy the doctor soidler.

***Confusing context;
no focus***

Instead of a tepee an Iroquois indian lives in a longhouse Little Bear says "I live in no tepee. I live longhouse! "Not want toy" said the indian, and turned his back, folding his arms across his chest with an air of finality.

The Iroquois indians love to eat meat Little Bear tells Omri "No good sorry! Little Bear hungry, work all day, cook meat, now what I eat! I chop you down like a tree!" "You no Great Spirit! Only stupid boy! Fight, spoil good meal! You feel shame!"

***Two unconnected,
purposeless
citations***

The Indian in the Cupboard showed me never to bring a toy to life because Little Bear has to have meat witch shows me that if I brought a toy to life I would have to spare alot of meat. Also I would have to make sure that I had a longhouse not a teepee so my Indian wouldn't yell at me.

Effectiveness Score = 1

This response to literature does not demonstrate an understanding of the text. The writer has no focus and cites random details with no connected meaning. The language is confusing in places. Citations alone are not enough to have a piece meet the standard in fourth grade; they must be connected to the focus.